



**Analysis of the implementation
of the principles of Public Transparency
in European Regional Legislative Assemblies**

**CALRE Working Group on e-Democracy
2015 Edition**

**Coordinated by Juan Pablo Durán Sánchez,
President of the Andalusian Parliament**

Introduction	3
<i>Why a study on Transparency?</i>	4
<i>Methodology</i>	5
Part I. Indicators for the Analysis of the Implementation of Public Transparency	7
<i>Regulations and Legislation</i>	8
<i>Visibility of Transparency</i>	8
<i>Content</i>	9
<i>Requests for information</i>	13
<i>Valuation of Public Transparency</i>	13
Part II. Evaluation of Good Practices in Transparency	15
Part III. Innovative Projects and Initiatives in Public Transparency	19
Conclusions	30
Acknowledgements	33

The Transparency of public institutions is inherent to Democracy and plays a fundamental role in the development of an advanced democratic society and in the promotion of a fluid, proactive relationship between the institutions and the citizen.

With the enshrinement of the Right to Information in the Declaration of the Human and Civil Rights in France in 1789, recognised by the General Assembly of the United Nations in 1948, the foundations were laid for the regulations and laws which, today, regulate, promote and protect the Transparency of public institutions and the citizens' right of access to information.

Over recent decades, as the different European States, and the regions which comprise them, have developed the mechanisms necessary to guarantee Public Transparency, the accountability of the institutions takes on a new dimension in the 21st century thanks to Information and Communication Technologies (ICT), with Internet being the main player and, in this case, an ally.

The Internet is, therefore, an essential tool for two-way communication between the institutions and the citizens in the field of Transparency. In the case of the institutions, it eliminates barriers and obstacles when providing Active Publicity, which involves the dissemination of public information at the initiative of the institutions which hold it. In the case of the citizens, ICTs guarantee that they can exercise their right of access to public information, providing the means and mechanisms by which to address the institutions to request information of interest.

A new scenario which is validated and protected by the development of new regulations and legislation, such as the Council of Europe Convention on Access to Public Documents, of 18 June 2009, and other European directives, as well as the enactment or adaptation of transparency laws in European States and their regions.

Why a study on Transparency?

Public Transparency, together with the mechanisms which encourage public participation, constitutes a unique opportunity to promote interaction between the representatives and the represented and to bring European citizens closer to the institutions, encouraging their interest and regaining their trust.

In this regard, one of the main objectives of the Working Group on e-Democracy of the Conference of European Regional Legislative Assemblies (CALRE), coordinated by the Presidency of the Andalusian Parliament, is to promote Transparency and the accountability of European regional parliaments through the principles of access to public information and Active Publicity.

In the 2013 and 2014 editions, the elements of Public Transparency were analysed within the general concept of e-Democracy. However, on this occasion, and given the growing importance and visibility of the principles of Public Transparency, which can be seen both in the interest shown by the institutions and in the demand from the citizens, the Working Group considered it opportune to carry out a specific study on the *“Implementation of Public Transparency in European regional assemblies and parliaments”*.

The objective is to ascertain and define the model of Public Transparency in European regional legislative assemblies and to produce a document that will serve as the basis for the analysis of evolution in the field in the coming years, and to advise and/or serve as a guide to European regional parliaments which are in the initial or intermediate stages of the implementation of Transparency measures.

Methodology

The study of the *Implementation of Public Transparency in European Regional Legislative Assemblies* has been undertaken by means of a questionnaire sent to the Parliaments and Assemblies which are members of CALRE.

The questionnaire was elaborated on the basis of items similar to those evaluated by specialised bodies and associations in Transparency International, with three differentiated analytical blocks.

Firstly, the indicators of the implementation of Public Transparency in European regional parliaments, which include *“Regulations and Legislation”*, *“Visibility of Transparency”*, *“Content”* or Active Publicity, *“Request for Information”* and *“Valuation of Public Transparency”*.

The second analytical block is centred on the valuation of good Public Transparency practices by means of the quantitative and qualitative analysis of the measures used to encourage and promote Transparency and access to public information.

Lastly, there is a third block in which regional parliaments and assemblies which have taken part in the study are invited to share their innovative projects and initiatives in the field of Public Transparency.

The questionnaires were sent by e-mail to all of the CALRE assemblies and parliaments in early April 2015 and the responses were received during the second quarter of 2015.

A total of 23 regional parliaments and assemblies from six European countries responded to the request for collaboration with the CALRE Working Group on e-Democracy study.

The participants were the assemblies of Abruzzo (Italy), Andalusia (Spain), Asturias (Spain), Azores (Portugal), Calabria (Italy), the Canary Islands (Spain), Cantabria (Spain), Friuli Venezia Giulia (Italy), Lombardy (Italy), Madrid (Spain), Molise (Italy), Upper Austria (Austria), the Basque Country

(Spain), Piedmont (Italy), Emilia Romagna (Italy), La Rioja (Spain), Saxony (Germany), Salzburg (Austria), Schleswig-Holstein (Germany), Styria (Germany), Tuscany (Italy), Voralberg (Austria) and Walloon (Belgium).

The results and statistics from the study, following the order of the analytical blocks of the questionnaire, are shown below.

PART I. Indicators for the Analysis of the Implementation of Public Transparency

The implementation of Public Transparency in European legislative assemblies has been evaluated through the analysis of indicators in five areas:

Regulations and legislation, to ascertain the degree of development of the regulations and laws on Public Transparency in the participating parliaments.

Visibility of Transparency, with regard to the use of Information and Communication Technologies for the purpose of Active Publicity.

Contents to discover the type of public information and data that the institutions share at their own initiative and which includes data of interest about members of parliament, parliamentary groups, administrative procurement, the parliamentary budget and the personnel of the assemblies. This information is known as Active Publicity.

Requests for information, about the mechanisms provided for the citizens to demand public information about Parliamentary activity.

Valuation of Public Transparency, to reveal the importance given to Public Transparency by the assemblies.

Regulations and Legislation

Ninety-five percent of parliaments have a national law or regulation governing Transparency. The earliest dates back to 1980, such as the regulations developed in Italy and their later modifications, while the most recent was applied in 2014, in the case of the Azores (Portugal).

At regional level, **only half (52%) have specific regional regulations on Public Transparency.** These are the assemblies of Abruzzo, Andalusia, Calabria, the Canary Islands, Friuli Venezia Giulia, Molise, Emilia Romagna, La Rioja, Salzburg, Tuscany, Voralberg and Walloon. The first were passed in Italy in 1983 and the most recent was the Law on Public Transparency of Andalusia, passed in 2014.

Despite this, **61 percent of the parliaments surveyed regulate public transparency processes by means of their internal rules and regulations,** implementing the national rules only in the case that there is no regional regulation. This is the situation of the parliaments and assemblies of Abruzzo, Andalusia, Calabria, the Canary Islands, Friuli Venezia Giulia, Lombardy, Madrid, Molise, Piedmont, Emilia Romagna, Salzburg, Tuscany, Voralberg and Walloon.

Visibility of Transparency

European regional legislative assemblies have embraced visibility in the exercise of Public Transparency through the use of Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs). Thus, **eight of ten of the Parliaments surveyed have a specific space devoted to Transparency on their website** implemented between 2000 and 2014.

Moreover, 65 percent have specific personnel working in the area of Transparency.

Content

Assembly Members

Some of the data which arouses most interest among the citizens with respect to their institutions is information about public representatives. In this regard, **one hundred percent of the assemblies include a personal file on each assembly member on their website**, although the results of the study indicate that the public information provided about the assembly members varies widely.

All of the assemblies stand out for the inclusion of information about the members, their biographical details, the office held and their parliamentary initiatives (90 percent) and offer means of contacting the public representatives by e-mail (95 percent).

However, they are not so forthcoming in the provision of other types of information. **Only four out of ten publish the parliamentary diary of assembly members**, while 14 percent include the political agenda (whose publication is, in all events, at the assembly member's discretion).

As regards economic information, **six out of ten assemblies include detailed information on the remuneration of members**, half include information about their declaration of assets and 46 percent include their income tax declaration.

Information about Assembly Members	
Personal online file on each member	100%
Biography of the members	95%
Functions of and/or office held by the members	100%
Interventions in assembly sessions and commissions of each member in the personal online file	72%
Legislative initiatives proposed by each assembly member	90%
Parliamentary diary of the members	40%
Political diary of the members	14%
Are members required to give information about their political agenda?	-
E-mail address of the members	95%
Social network profiles of the members	28%
Information about their declaration of assets	50%
Information about their income tax declaration	46%
Detailed information about their remuneration	59%
Does this personalised information appear in the file of each member?	65%
Attendance of members at plenary sessions	64%

Table 1

Parliamentary groups

In the case of information about Parliamentary Groups, the general information provided by assemblies is notable, with data about the composition and funding of parliamentary groups, while they need to improve the Active Publicity regarding the internal regulations of the groups and their accounting, which is provided in half of the cases.

Information about Parliamentary Groups	
Information about the internal regulations of the groups	59%
Information about the composition and structure of parliamentary groups	100%
Information about the funding of the groups	82%
Accounting information about parliamentary groups	55%

Table 2

Administrative procurement

Six out of ten assemblies offer detailed information about administrative procurement processes, although only half include data on minor contracts, with very different thresholds, from all contracts to only those of more than €3000.

Information about Administrative Procurement	
Information about procurement rules	65%
Information about the members of the procurement committee	65%
Information about public calls for tenders	64%
List of current contracts	60%
List of minor contracts	52%
From what amount?	0 - €3000
Detailed list of official vehicles	48%

Table 3

Parliamentary Budget

This section deserves **special distinction for the assemblies** surveyed, since practically all of them provide **detailed information about the Parliamentary Budget and its implementation**. Only one of the assemblies does not offer information in this section.

Information about the Budget	
Initial parliamentary budget published	95%
Implementation of the budget published	78%
Final liquidation of the budget published	92%
Evolution of the budget over recent years published	70%

Table 4

Parliamentary Personnel

Seventy-five percent of the assemblies publish a list of jobs, and of these, 59% give details of the profiles and remuneration of personnel. Furthermore, 83% include information about offers of public employment and selection processes on their website.

Information on Personnel	
List of jobs in the Parliament published	74%
Profiles detailed	59%
Remuneration detailed	59%
Organisation chart of services and managers published	78%
Offers of public employment and personnel selection processes published	83%

Table 5

Requests for information

Three out of four assemblies surveyed complete the Public Transparency cycle by providing citizens with the mechanisms necessary to request public information from the institution.

The response time varies from same-day replies to a maximum period of 30 days.

Only 14% of the assemblies have an FAQ section on Public Transparency on their website to attend to requests by citizens.

Valuation of Public Transparency

After analysing the content published on their websites, the assemblies responding to the survey were asked about their valuation of Public Transparency and its relevance in the relationship between institutions and citizens.

The assemblies agree that **Transparency is the appropriate means to regain the trust of the citizens** in the institutions and their representatives.

Valuation of Public Transparency (4: High. 3: Fairly High. 2: Low. 1: Very Low)				
	4	3	2	1
Public Transparency brings the institutions closer to the citizens	65%	30%	-	5%
Public Transparency increases the alienation of the citizens with respect to the institutions	9%	9%	24%	58%
Public Transparency is a priority of the institutions	55%	35%	10%	-

Table 6

Sixty-five percent of the assemblies believe that Public Transparency is valued “highly” in bringing the institutions closer to the citizens, while 30 believe that it is “fairly favourable”. Furthermore, 90 percent believe that Public Transparency is a priority of the institutions.

Moreover, 82 percent do not believe that Transparency increases the alienation of the citizens with respect to the institutions.

PART II. Evaluation of Good Practices in Transparency

In this section, the parliaments evaluate the initiatives and classify the good practices for the implementation of Public Transparency on the basis of the indicators analysed in the first section.

In each section, a score of 1 to 4 (1 being “very little”, 2 “little”, 3 “fairly” and 4 “very much”) is given to the 24 main indicators from the first section on the basis of their Viability, Cost, Opportuneness, Efficacy, Innovation, Effect in generating proximity with citizens and Regaining citizens’ trust.

The final evaluation of the initiatives was calculated as follows:

Final classification: *Scores for Viability + Opportuneness + Efficacy + Innovation + Effect in generating proximity with citizens + Regaining citizens’ trust – Cost.*

It should be noted that of the 23 assemblies surveyed, 15 completed this part of the questionnaire, four completed it partially and four left it blank.

With a maximum score of 456 points, the assemblies afforded **the highest score (341 points) to the publication on the Parliament’s website of information on Public Transparency**, while the least highly valued initiative was the publication of the political diary of assembly members in their online file (216 points).

It is worthy of note that the parliaments evaluated the availability of a space to request public information in the middle of the ranking of the 24 indicators surveyed (283 points)

Visibility of Public Transparency	
	Score
Specific space or section on the website devoted to Public Transparency	313
Information about Public Transparency on the website	341

Table 7

Content	
	Score
Personal file on the assembly members	322
Initiatives proposed by the member in the online personal file	263
Intervention by members in plenary sessions in the online personal file	280
Parliamentary diary of the members in the online personal file	259
Political diary of the members in the online personal file	216
E-mail of the members in the online personal file	319
Declaration of assets of the members in the online personal file	276
Income tax declaration of the members in the online personal file	306
Remuneration of the members in the online personal file	279
Composition and structure of the parliamentary groups	302
Funding of the parliamentary groups	270
Accounts of the parliamentary groups	287

Public calls for tenders	284
List of current contracts	266
List of minor contracts	272
List of official cars	242
Publication of initial budget	316
Publication of the implementation of the budget	302
Publication of the liquidation of the budget	317
Publication of the evolution of the budget	296
Publication of the list of jobs	259

Table 8

Requests for Public Information	
	Score
Space to request public information	283

Table 9

As regards the scores given, **the most highly-valued Public Transparency initiatives**, in descending order, are:

1. Information about Public Transparency on the website
2. Personal file of the assembly member
3. E-mail of the assembly members in the online personal file
4. Publication of the implementation of the parliamentary budget
5. Publication of the initial budget
6. Specific space on Transparency on the website
7. Income tax declaration of the members in the online personal file
8. Publication of the implementation of the budget
9. Composition and structure of the Parliamentary Groups
10. Accounts of the Parliamentary Groups

The least highly valued initiatives, on the other hand, are:

20. Initiatives proposed by the assembly member in the personal online file
21. List of current contracts
22. Publication of the list of jobs
23. List of official cars
24. Political diary of the members in the online file

After comparing the valuation given to good practices with the indicators in the first section, it can be seen that, with some exceptions, such as the initiatives proposed by the assembly members, the most highly-valued practices are coherent with the Public Transparency information published by the assemblies.

In the same way, one of the least common practices, the publication of the political diary of the assembly members, is also the measure which is least highly-valued by the parliaments surveyed.

PART III. INNOVATIVE PROJECTS AND INITIATIVES IN PUBLIC TRANSPARENCY

The innovative Public Transparency initiatives and projects of the parliaments and assemblies are described below.

Regional Council of Abruzzo (Italy)

On 28 January 2015, the Three-Year Plan for the Prevention of Corruption 2015-2017 and the Three-Year Transparency Programme 2015-2017 was passed by the Regional Council of Abruzzo, both elaborated by the head of transparency and anti-corruption measures.

This person was assigned responsibility for enforcing vigilance and monitoring commitments in the field of Transparency and was also responsible for ensuring that anti-corruption measures were updated. Each year, the Regional Assembly approves the Three-Year Transparency Programme which regulates the manner in which State laws and regulations on transparency are updated.

In order to enforce the law on Transparency, the website includes a section on Transparency and what is called “Transparent Administration”, following the model provided by the ANAC (National Anti-Corruption Authority), which guarantees the quality, updating, accuracy and accessibility of information.

“Transparent administration” offers the citizens information, data and documents about the regional activity of the Assembly, assembly members, personnel of the organisation and its services and functions. Furthermore, information is published about the parliamentary groups, their composition, personnel and accounts.

Together with the obligatory information, the “Transparent Administration” offers further information in order to enhance Transparency. For example, all management action is published in full, even though this is not required by law.

Using the channels and means provided, citizens can report cases of corruption and maladministration. This foments a positive interaction with the citizen.

A transparency and corruption section has also been created on the website where citizens can find the laws and regulations related to the “Civic Access” institute.

“Civic Access” allows citizens to monitor the actions of the administration, the fulfilment of transparency obligations, the objectives of the administration and the right to an appropriate use of public resources. Access is free and does not require justification.

Andalusian Parliament (Spain)

The Andalusian Parliament has laid down the objective of the continuous improvement of Public Transparency. The leading exponent of this objective is the Transparency Portal of the Andalusian Parliament, which was launched in late 2014, in compliance with state and regional legislation on Transparency.

The Transparency Portal is offered as an instrument for the dissemination of information about the activity of the institution and aims, among other objectives, to contribute to an improvement of citizens’ trust in the Parliament and of its public image in general.

The Portal is structured in five main areas of information offering Active Publicity, including data about the Members, Parliamentary Groups, Administrative Procurement, the Parliamentary Budget and Parliamentary

Personnel.

There is also a specific space where the citizens can request public information about the regional parliament, as well as an FAQ section.

The information offered in the Transparency Portal, as well as the specific space on the website, is also available and accessible transversely in other sections of the website of the Andalusian Parliament, in an attempt to facilitate access to information.

The data on the Transparency Portal are subject to continuous updating and the citizens are informed of this in the “Latest News” section of the Portal and highlighted on the homepage of the Andalusian Parliament website.

In parallel to the launch of the Transparency Portal, and in order to facilitate its management, the Transparency and Member Assistance Unit was established, in coordination with the rest of the Parliament’s services, to take responsibility for the updating of the information and respond to the citizens’ requests for information.

The Andalusian Parliament modified its Rules in order to adapt the regulations to the new Transparency contents.

Parliament of Cantabria (Spain)

The Parliament of Cantabria was classified in March 2014 by Transparency International as the most transparent of all of the Parliaments in Spain, including the Congress and Senate, with an overall score of 98.8 points out of 100.

The standout projects are numerous and varied, with the following being worthy of note:

The **TRANSPARENCY SPACE**, a singular element of our own on our website, offers complete, detailed information about important issues including: Organisation, rules and functioning; Public Participation; Activities (parliamentary, institutional, cultural, etc); comprehensive economic information.

The **SCHOOL OF DEMOCRACY** platform, an online tool on our website offered to all of the school students who make educational visits to our Parliament, including educational material differentiated by level (Primary and Secondary), about the Parliament and representative democracy.

OPEN PARLIAMENT, by means of which the general public can participate in the debate over proposed Laws that are being enacted in the Parliament, submitting their opinions and proposals to the Members and Parliamentary Groups.

Presence on the **MAIN SOCIAL NETWORKS** (Twitter, Facebook, Google+, Instagram, Flickr, Foursquare, LinkedIn) as a prime means of being in contact with the citizens, especially with new audiences, with permanent 24/7 interaction.

Regional Council of Friuli Venezia Giulia (Italy)

The objectives of the Legislative Assembly of Friuli Venezia Giulia include the improvement of the quality of the legislation enacted and to guarantee maximum transparency in the regulations in order to allow citizens to enjoy better control over the exercise of legislative power.

The database of regulations is kept permanently updated and can be consulted free of charge. Every year, the Legislative Assembly draws up a document analysing the quality of the regulations passed by the Assembly. The regulations on Transparency have improved in recent years.

Law 150/2009 was modified by Law 33/2013, which reformed the regulations on publicity and transparency requirements to be met by the Public Administration and underlines that transparency must be conceived as the full accessibility of the activities of government as a precondition in order to offer the best possible services to the citizens.

The most relevant measure adopted under our legislation is the “citizens’ right of access”. This right may be demanded when an act, document or any other information has not been published when it should have been. Any citizen may exercise the “citizens’ right of access” free of charge. The public administration must respond to the request within a deadline of 30 days.

Each year, the Regional Council of Friuli Venezia Giulia adopts a “three-year transparency and integrity programme” which contains the initiatives and activities designed to guarantee the growing transparency demanded of public administrations.

Regional Council of Molise (Italy)

The Public Transparency Project of the Regional Council of Molise has involved the development of a mobile device application (iOS and Android). The information platform, at an initial stage, includes the following sections: Organisation, News, Minutes of individual meetings of the Council; Information about Council Members and their interventions; Notifications to allow immediate updates.

The platform is structured so as to facilitate access to data on the Regional Council website, data on the actions of the Regional Council and data about laws.

Parliament of the Basque Country (Spain)

Since the launch of its website, and as a working concept and an objective for information, the Basque parliament has set up an integrated system of transparency linked to Parliamentary files (the “Glass Cube” Theory).

The systems that have been put in place allow both the personnel of the institution and the parliamentarians to help citizens to access all of the original documents, the entire process and all of the steps during processing. This way of working has made the processing of all case files completely transparent. Furthermore, proprietary tools for the segmentation of information and subscription to issues and initiatives (Zabalik) and participation tools (Parte Hartu, ADI!, ADI!Bakea), ensure that the citizens are not simply informed, but that they can interact with the Basque Parliament.

The institution has always opted for transparency and this was reflected in the Regulations of the Basque Parliament (November 2012).

Article 108

1. The Basque Parliament guarantees maximum transparency in its activities.
2. All citizens shall have the right to access parliamentary documents. To this end, Parliament shall create a registry of Parliamentary documents for public access. The documents published in the Official Gazette of the Basque Parliament and in the Record of Proceedings and in the databases of Parliamentary documents and initiatives shall be directly accessible by means of Internet or electronic communication networks. Other Parliamentary documents which are not directly accessible by these means shall be provided by prior written request.

Article 109

The Bureau of the Chamber shall take the opportune measures so that citizens can enjoy telematic access to the documents related to

the initiatives being processed in the Parliament and so that they might monitor the process. In the same way, it shall establish procedures to facilitate contact between citizens and parliamentarians. In order to facilitate this transparency process:

a) Access to documentation must guarantee that written documents are included in the case files of each initiative and are available within a period of not more than two days from the moment they are formally accepted for processing or complete any stage of the procedure. In the same way, audio and visual files must be included in the digital case files within a period of not more than three days.

b) There shall be procedures which facilitate the search for information by the citizens, to which end statistical information and catalogues of the case files shall be offered, broken down by content or type. In the same way, the search tools of the databases referring to Parliamentary activity shall be published on the Internet.

c) Telematic mechanisms shall be established to enable citizens to monitor any initiative which might be of their interest. The citizens who are interested shall have the right to be informed, at least weekly, of the latest news regarding the processing of the initiatives or issues in question.

d) Updated files shall be published on the parliamentarians working in the Chamber. From these files, there shall be access both to the initiatives they have proposed and the interventions they have made.

e) There shall be a live broadcast service of plenary sessions on Internet. The audio soundtrack shall be available in the official languages.

f) A notification system shall be established to allow citizens interested in specific initiatives to receive information by electronic means regarding the date and the body which is processing the

initiative. This notification shall allow access to the complete case file of the initiative in question.

Article 110

The space devoted to participation on the website of the Basque Parliament shall also be accessible so that any citizen may publicly make suggestions and contributions and be informed of the results of same.

The institution is continuing to develop new spaces to provide a transparency portal as laid down in the 2013 Law. This space will be operative in December 2015, together with an adaptation of the website to the new concepts incorporated with Open Data.

Regional Council of Piedmont (Italy)

The Regional Council of Piedmont has applied the regulations in force regarding Public Transparency, in particular D. LEG. n ° 33 / 2013.

Legislative Assembly of Emilia Romagna (Italy)

In recent years, since 2011, this Assembly has taken the decision to devote part of its website to Transparency. Since then, it has published information about members, their salaries, the budget of political groups and the entire budget used for political affairs.

All of this was implemented before the national legislation was passed and it was established as an obligation of all public administrations.

It has also developed a specific section on the website which provides budgetary information to the media.

Parliament of La Rioja (Spain)

This Parliament underlines the innovation that has come with the launch in 2014 of the Transparency window.

Parliament of Salzburg (Austria)

While implementing the EU regulations on public sector information (PSI Directive, the Environmental Information Directive), the State of Salzburg has taken numerous measures and adopted provisions to improve Public Transparency.

In the field of budgetary transparency:

- > The State Budget and Accounts are available to the public.
- > By law, recently acquired financial instruments must be reported annually to the Regional Parliament.
- > By law, the State Court of Auditors scrutinises the annual budget report. Its results are public.

As regards the transparency of party funding:

- > Party funding must be submitted to the State Court of Auditors, whose report is public and is debated in parliament.

Regional Council of Tuscany (Italy)

With the regional law of 6 November 2012, nº 6, on the “Rules on public councillors of the Registry and regional ministers - Changes to I.R. 61/2012”, the region of Tuscany has created a registry of public directors and regional ministers, of which the Council of Regional Ministers and the Regional Council of Commissioners are responsible for the independence of the sections, to guarantee the electronic publication of information on their respective institutional websites, which is expressed in a clear, structured manner and is constantly updated.

For some time, in fact, there had been a need to increase the transparency of institutional activities and to make all of the information and data on the activities of their representatives available to the citizens on institutional websites.

The accessibility of the data on the elected bodies and their work constitutes the basis for the smooth running of the institutions and represents the application of the principle of transparency, the basis for a good relationship with the public and with public opinion. The websites which afford everyone the opportunity to access information is one of the practical applications of these principles.

In 2015, the Regional Council of Tuscany modified the Regional Law of 6 November 2012, nº 61, to adapt it to the provisions introduced under National Legislative Decree nº 33/2013, on the “Reorganisation of provisions applicable to information requirements, transparency and the dissemination of information by public authorities.”

Walloon Parliament (Belgium)

In parallel to the specific Public Transparency information included on the website, the Walloon Parliament provides additional information in press releases with data about the plenary sessions.

CONCLUSIONS

The responses of the 23 European regional legislative assemblies and parliaments which have participated in the study portray institutions which are committed to Public Transparency, with a high degree of implementation and development which runs in parallel to the enactment and application of regulations and legislation on Transparency in their respective countries and regions.

In this regard, the proactive attitude of the regional assemblies in the field of Active Publicity must be underlined, that is, in publishing detailed information about the institution, its activity, the parliamentary representatives and budget management. Thus, 80% of the Parliaments have a specific area dedicated to Public Transparency on their websites and 70% have personnel dedicated to Transparency.

As regards the content, an outstanding feature is the information provided about parliamentarians (members' files, functions, initiatives and remuneration), Parliamentary Groups, the budget of the institution and its personnel. Indicators in these areas are all above 80%.

Likewise, the parliaments comply with another of the requirements of Public Transparency by providing the mechanisms necessary for the citizens to request public information from the institution (75% of the sample surveyed).

However, less information is provided about the parliamentary and political diaries of assembly members or about the list of minor contracts.

It should be highlighted that the assemblies show coherence as regards the relationship between the information that they publish and that which they consider of greatest value in the exercise and promotion of Public Transparency.

As can be seen from the second part of this report, the most highly-valued Public Transparency initiatives, in descending order, are:

1. Information on Public Transparency on the website
2. Personal file of the assembly members
3. E-mail of assembly members in the online personal file
4. Publication of the implementation of the parliamentary budget
5. Publication of the initial budget
6. Specific space on Transparency on the website
7. Income tax declaration of assembly members in the online personal file
8. Publication of the implementation of the budget
9. Composition and structure of the Parliamentary Groups
10. Accounts of the Parliamentary Groups

In all cases, with the exception of the accounts of Parliamentary Groups, the assemblies apply these good practices.

In contrast, the least-valued initiatives are:

20. Initiatives proposed by the assembly member in the personal online file
21. List of current contracts
22. Publication of a list of jobs
23. List of official cars
24. Political diary of the assembly members in the online file

Again, there is coherence, except in the case of the initiatives proposed by the assembly member, between the least-valued items and the information which is provided least on the assembly websites.

The third part of the study, on Innovative Transparency Projects of the assemblies, evidences their commitment to continuous improvement and updating of the means that promote Public Transparency, with the establishment, among other measures, of control mechanisms to ensure that the institutions comply with the regulations.

It can be said, therefore, that Public Transparency, understood to mean the full accessibility of the activities of the parliaments, is today a reality among CALRE members, which have incorporated Transparency into their daily activity, by their own conviction.

The regional parliaments, then, agree that Public Transparency is the ideal means to regain the citizens' trust in the institutions and in their representatives, bringing them closer to the public. For this reason, 90% of those surveyed consider it a priority for their institutions.

**The Presidency of the Andalusian Parliament,
as the coordinator of the CALRE Working Group on e-Democracy,
wishes to thank the assemblies and parliaments
which have collaborated in this study**

Regional Council of Abruzzo
Andalusian Parliament
Regional Parliament of the Principality of Asturias
Regional Assembly of the Azores
Regional Council of Calabria
Parliament of the Canary Islands
Parliament of Cantabria
Regional Council of Friuli Venezia Giulia
Regional Council of Lombardy
Assembly of Madrid
Regional Council of Molise
Regional Parliament of Upper Austria
Parliament of the Basque Country
Regional Council of Piedmont
Legislative Assembly of Emilia Romagna
Parliament of La Rioja
Regional Parliament of Saxony
Parliament of Salzburg
Schleswig Holstein
Parliament of Styria
Regional Council of Tuscany
Parliament of Vorarlberg
Walloon Parliament

The Presidency of the Andalusian Parliament extends these thanks
to the Presidency of CALRE and the 18 participating parliaments
of the 2015 Working Group on e-Democracy